DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 315 807 CS 507 001

AUTHOR Williams, David E.
TITLE Rhetoric of the Temperance Movement: Ohio's Contribution.
PUB DATE Sep 89
NOTE 16p.; Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the Speech Communication Association of Ohio (Cincinnati, OH, September 1989).
PUB TYPE Speeches/Conference Papers (150) -- Viewpoints (120) -- Information Analyses (070)

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC01 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS *Communication Research; Interpersonal Communication; Models; Persuasive Discourse; Research Methodology; *Rhetoric; Rhetorical Criticism
IDENTIFIERS Nineteenth Century Rhetoric; *Ohio; Rhetorical Community; *Social Movements; Temperance Movement

ABSTRACT

Instead of adopting or developing a theoretical or methodological approach to social movement study, researchers might benefit from gathering an understanding of a particular movement's history by narrowing the focus of the study for rhetorical analysis. Convention papers and journal articles should identify a specific stage, sub-group, person, or speech for rhetorical analysis. The changing needs and constraints of a social movement necessitate this approach. Differing stages or rhetors in a movement will present differing rhetorical strategies. For example, the Temperance Movement in the United States provides communication scholars with a complete protest movement. One approach would be to use a narrowed focus on a particular issue, such as Ohio's contribution to the Temperance Movement, particularly that of the two significant rhetorical forces of: (1) the Anti-Saloon League's American Issue Publishing Company; and (2) the Women's Christian Temperance Union's roots in Ohio. These two factors illustrate the rhetorical impact on the inception and growth of the movement. (KEH)

****
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
****

ED315807

RHETORIC OF THE TEMPERANCE MOVEMENT:

OHIO'S CONTRIBUTION

by

DAVID E. WILLIAMS
Ohio University
School of Interpersonal Communication
Athens, Ohio 45701
(614) 593-4828

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY
David E. Williams

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)
☐ This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.
☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.
• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy.

CS507001

A paper presented at the annual meeting of the Speech Communication Association of Ohio, September 1989, Cincinnati.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

RHETORIC OF THE TEMPERANCE MOVEMENT:

OHIO'S CONTRIBUTION

INTRODUCTION

The Temperance Movement in the United States provides communication scholars with a complete protest movement. This movement offers the critic a variety of appeals and a clearly established consummation with its final victory in the eighteenth amendment. Rhetorical artifacts of the movement are accessible and therefore, possibilities for analysis are varied. The critic may, however, find him/herself faced with two initial problems. First, there may be some confusion as to how one should approach the study of social movements. Second, there is suprisingly little available scholarship on the Temperance Movement, from the field of communication, in which to begin an analysis.

This paper will attempt to reduce each of these two problems. First, the paper will review the status and trends of social movement research. The result will be an appeal for a more microscopic study of social movements and an argument against the study of a whole movement with a single paper or article. Second, the paper will take a microscopic view of the Temperance Movement to examine Ohio's contribution to the cause. This section will focus on the Anti-Saloon League Publishing Company of Westerville, Ohio and the Women's Christian Temperance Union's roots in Ohio.

THE NON-DIRECTIONAL STATUS OF MOVEMENT STUDIES

Leland Griffin (1980) noted the beginning of movement studies can be traced to 1946 when his advisor, Herbert Wichelns, presented a paper on that topic at the Speech Association of America convention. In the following year, Crandall (1947) offered a method for the study of social movements. However, the general beginning of social movement study is considered to be Griffin's (1952) article, "The Rhetoric of Historical Movements" in which he suggested the critic should focus on the rhetoric within the historical movement and offered a model for the growth of a movement. Through the 1960's and 70's and into the 80's movement studies were in vogue and attempts were made to narrow the focus of study and develop acceptable methods of investigation.

The frequency of movement studies began to decrease in the 1980's. However, in 1980 a collective analysis of the approaches to movement criticism was made available to scholars. An entire issue of the Central States Speech Journal was devoted to movement studies and Riches and Sillars' (1980) presented a comprehensive review of the literature in the Western Journal of Speech Communication.

Griffin's (1980) lead article in CSSJ promoted the need to "welcome a variety of conceptions of movements and approaches to their analysis" (p. 232). Andrews (1980) urged critics to continue the merger between history and theory while Smith (1980) suggested the move away from

single movement studies and toward the study of themes shared between movements.

Cathcart (1980) argued that social movements should be studied around the concept of confrontation between the change seeking collective and the establishment. Lucas's (1980) position was that movement studies should focus on how rhetoric changes throughout the movement. Zarefsky and McGee, however, felt that historical studies may be beneficial but social movements should not develop their own theoretical positions.

Riches and Sillars' (1980) review included 101 studies which were divided into macroscopic, microscopic and comparison studies. A macroscopic study was an "all-inclusive study which seeks characterization of the movement in its completeness" (p. 277). Macroscopic studies were divided into macro-historical and macro-rhetorical approaches. Macro-historical studies allowed the critic to record the history of the movement's ideas instead of "individual bits of rhetoric" (p. 278). The macro-rhetorical studies focused more on the rhetorical analysis of messages. Macro-historical and macro-rhetorical studies accounted for 12 and 25 of the 101 studies, respectively.

Microscopic studies were those which "explore a single element within a movement" (p. 279). These included single events within a movement, strategies within a movement, speaker(s) within a movement and single issues within a

movement. These types of studies occured 18, 16, 14 and 14 times respectively. The final two studies "used rhetorical criticism to compare two movements on a point of joint interest" (p. 277).

A review of the social movement literature between 1981 and 1987 will demonstrate the growth or direction of study in the 1980's. The present review includes 41 articles with 29 identified as macroscopic and the remaining 12 as microscopic. An examination of the 29 macroscopic studies revealed a need to add a third catagory of theoretical studies. The primary purpose of theoretical studies was to add to the understanding of how social movements function or how they might be studied. Macroscopic and microscopic studies were catagorized with the following frequencies:

Macroscopic	-- 29	Microscopic	--12
macro-rhetorical	-- 13	speakers	-- 7
macro-historical	-- 10	strategies	-- 3
macro-theoretical	- 6	single issue	-- 2

Riches and Sillars' review of movement literature found the following methods, and their frequencies, used:

Neo-Aristotelian	-- 53	Fantasy-theme	-- 2
Historical-Interpretive	-- 33	Aesthetic	-- 1
Dramatistic	-- 7	Editorial	-- 1
Generic	-- 2		

Of the 41 post-1981 studies, seven could not be classified by method. The authors of these studies did not announce a method or theoretical framework to guide their analyses and

attempts to classify the essays would be too arbitrary to be accurate. The remaining 31 articles were classified in the following manner:

Historical-Interpretive	--7	Aesthetic Analysis	--2
Neo-Aristotelian	--6	Ego-Function	--2
Dramatistic	--5	Langauge Strategies	--2

Value analysis, fantasy theme, myth, metaphorical, organic systems, Requirement-Problems-Strategies, narrative, fantasy theme/dramatism, group and dyadic approaches were each used in one study.

These numerous approaches reveal that no single approach to movement study has developed and there is no indication that one is emerging. This paper will argue that rhetorical theorists should not concern themselves with a search for the proper method of movement analysis. The breadth of time and material for analysis, when studying a social movement from inception to consummation, can not be sufficiently addressed through a single method. When addressing the full scope of a social movement, rhetorical theorists should only concern themselves with general models of movement growth such as Griffin's (1952) original model or Stewart, Denton and Smith's (1984) "lifecycle of social movements". These are not analytical tools but they can help the researcher conceptualize the movement and determine a focus for the investigation.

Social movement researchers should disband hopes of adopting or developing a theoretical or methodological

approach to movement study. Researchers might benefit from gathering an understanding of a particular movement's history by narrowing the focus of the study for rhetorical analysis. Convention papers and journal articals should identify a specific stage, sub-group, person or speech for rhetorical analysis. Scholars who wish to address an entire movement should devote themselves to a book-legnth work. The changing needs and constraints of a social movement necessitates this approach. Differing stages or rhetors in a movement will present differing rhetorical strategies. Therefore, a single method will not sufficiently focus the analysis on the movement. This suggestion is not far from Griffin's (1952) original advise for studying a small movement because of the details to be covered are of value to critics.

Ohio's Contribution to the Temperance Movement

The possibilities for identifying a specific focus of a social movement are numerous. Whereas the focus might generally fall on a critical stage, rhetorical crisis or a particular figure; this section will focus on Ohio's contribution to the Temperance Movement. The first reason for this focus is somewhat obvious as it provides an opportunity for communication scholars in Ohio to become more informed about the communication history of their own state. A second reason for this focus is that two significant temperance forces where found in Ohio.

Therefore, this section will address the rhetorical force of (1) the Anti-Saloon League's American Issue Publishing Company and (2) the Women's Christian Temperance Union's roots in Ohio.

Anti-Saloon League

The Anti-Saloon League was maintained in Westerville, Ohio. As a Christian Science Monitor (1923) editorial noted, "Indeed Westerville, O., has a few less than 4,000 people, but out of the League (Anti-Saloon League) headquarters there go daily four tons of printed prohibition literature, and 3,000,000 letters by first class postage annually (p.2)."

The efforts of the Americal Issue Publishing Company was a major contribution in the dissemination of temperance rhetoric. Odegard (1966) labled the American Issue Publishing Company "the League's right arm of propaganda (p. 12)". Krout (1925) indicated "few special interest groups in the history of the American people have surpassed the temperance reformers in the distribution of literary propaganda (p.223)". He added "it seemed to be the aim of the societies to present to the reading public every conceivable appeal and argument that could be made through the medium of the printed page (p. 223)".

An indication of the prolific publishing in Westerville was provided by Odegard's (1966) listing of the American Issue production between 1909 and 1923 (p. 75).

Books	1,925,463
Pamphlets	5,271,715
Leaflets	114,675,431
Window Cards	2,322,056
Other cards tickets, etc.	18,522,471
Miscellaneous	21,553,032
General printing not strictly propaganda	80,512,132
Total	244,782,296

The stregnth of the American Issue and the temperance cause allowed it to operate without a specific social or political affiliation. Gusfield (1963) stated "the league followed the policy of rewarding our friends and punishing our enemies (p. 108). Odegard (1966) further detailed the stregnth of the Anti-Saloon League as "(1) centralization of authority, (2) singleness of purpose, (3) political utilization of the power of the Protestant Churches and (4) avoidance of entry into politics as a seperate political party.

However, the American Issue did have a political effect by influencing elections and running "wets" out of office. Between 1895 and 1903, 70 Ohio legislatures, who were opposed to temperance, lost their re-election attempts

partially because of the efforts of the American Issue (Odegard, 1966).

Examples of American Issue Publication materials find that temperance advocates not only produced an enormous amount of literature but used both logical and emotional appeals. Although the purpose of this section is not to attempt a textual analysis of temperance propaganda, the following ficticious saloon advertisement is offered as an example of the Anti-Saloon League's creativity and questionable rhetorical appeals.

Wanted - Boys for Customers

Most of our old customers are rapidly dropping out

Ten committed suicide last week

Twenty are in jail-eight in the chain gang.

Fifteen were sent to the poorhouse. One was hanged.

Three were sent to the insane asylum.

Most of the rest are not worth fooling with, they have no money.

WE NEED FRESH YOUNG BLOOD.

Along with books and surveys devoted to showing a rational public the ill effects of alcohol, the Anti-Saloon League released literature intended for children. Short stories such as Dr. W. Steward Whittemore's "What Happened to the Kittens and the Puppies" were designed to develop an

emotional hatred of alcohol among children. Whittemore's story relates an experiment which showed that kittens and puppies who are given alcohol will slow down, get sick, and eventually die.

Westerville, Ohio played a prominent role in the temperance cause. The American Issue Publishing Company served as a primary outlet for the rhetorical appeals of temperance advocates. By numbers of publications and variety of appeals, the temperance cause was well served by Westerville's Anti-Saloon League.

The Women's Christian Temperance Union and its roots in Ohio

The involvement of women in temperance reform provided a united force which moved quickly throughout the country. The deterioration of the family around the 1870's forced women, particularly wives and mothers, to become agitators who saw that they had no choice but to rally in support of the temperance cause. Blair (1888) quotes, "As woman and woman's possessions - child, husband, home - are they prey of alcohol, it is fitting that her sex should organize en masse for defensive and offensive warfare..." (p. 502). Blair also designated the Women's Christian Temperance Movement (later the WCTU) as "the leading force in temperance reform" (p. 502).

The seed for the WCTU was planted on December 23, 1873 when Dr. Dio Lewis delivered a lecture on temperance in Music Hall, Hillsboro, Ohio. Lewis, a Boston physician and

Lyceum lecturer, had delivered a lecture on "Our Girls" on the 22nd and was persuaded by Judge Albert Matthews to remain an extra day and give a free lecture on temperance. Lewis agreed and on the 23rd recalled to the audience how his mother and others joined together in prayer and persuaded liquor sellers to halt sales of alcohol. He then said "Ladies, you might do the same in Hillsboro if you had the same faith (Willard, 1972, p. 54)".

Lewis's remarks affected the audience to the extent that the very next day women met and marched behind the leadership of Eliza Judge Thompson, of Hillsboro, to drug stores, saloons and hotels to request that owners no longer sell alcohol. Such a response caused Lewis's speech to be referred to as the "great awakening in Ohio". The women's general approach was to frequently visit drinking establishments and hold prayer meetings, sing and lecture against alcohol. Willard (1972) relates that women in Hillsboro reduced he number of drinking establishments from 13 to one hotel and two saloons (p. 57).

The WCTU progressed from Hillsboro to Washington Court-House, Wilmington, New Vienna, Greenfield, Franaklin, Morrow, Oxford, McConnelsville, Mt. Vernon, Steubenville, Cleveland, Zanesville etc. in Ohio. The WCTU continued to grow partially because of the leadership of women who were simulatneously reforming alcohol use and women's position in society.

For example, Eliza D. Stewart, "Mother Stewart", of

Piketon, Ohio was an outgoing woman who helped organize others in the fight against alcohol. In January, 1872, during a speech she obtained a pledge from women to stand by drunkards' wives in the prosecution of saloon-keepers under the Adair Law. The Adair Law, in Ohio, was the first to make tavern owners responsible for the well-being of their patrons. Under this law, women and children were able to sue tavern owners if the selling of alcohol caused death or harm to husbands and fathers who were in the establishment. On another occasion, according to Willard (1972) Ms. Stewart was said to have disguised herself in order to purchase liquor in a tavern on Sunday. After the illegal sale was made the tavern owner was convicted.

Efforts like this combined with the willingness of women to enter saloons and endure verbal and physical abuse, while preaching for temperance helped change the image of women. Such conduct as Gusfield (1963) notes, "was shocking by the rules of middle-class female conduct of the time" (p. 88).

The Ohio contribution to the temperance cause was instrumental in the early stages of the movement. Westerville and the Anti-Saloon League was a major publishing outlet. The proliferation of materials from this Ohio town made it possible for temperance workers to develop and distribute rhetorical appeals at an amazing rate given the time period in U.S. history. Likewise, the WCTU became, possibly, the strongest force in the temperance

cause. The organization grew rapidly but can be traced to the heroic effects of women in Ohio.

This paper has attempted to argue for a modified approach to movement studies. The study of social movements has been shown to have been muddled in a variety of approaches with none gaining dominance. This paper suggests that movement study would benefit if scholars dismiss the possibility of whole movement studies. Instead, scholars should focus on specific segments of a movement or book length works of entire movements.

As an example of how the study may be focused, this paper identified a particular issue within the Temperance Movement. The focus on Ohio's contribution is justified because of the influence of the Anti-Saloon League and the WCTU. These two factors of the movement were briefly described along with the rhetorical impact they had on the inception and growth of the movement.

REFERENCES

Andrews, J. R. (1980). History and theory in the study of the rhetoric of social movements. Central States Speech Journal, 31, 274-281.

Blair, H. (1888). The temperance movement. Boston: William E. Smythe Company.

Cathcart, R. (1980). Defining social movements by their rhetorical form. Central States Speech Journal, 31, 267-273.

Crandall, S. (1947). The beginnings of a methodology for social control studies in public address. Quarterly Journal of Speech, 33, 36-39.

Griffin, L. (1952). The rhetoric of historical movements. Quarterly Journal of Speech, 38, 184-188.

Griffin, L. (1980). On studying movements. Central States Speech Journal, 31, 225-232.

Gusfield, J. (1963). Symbolic crusade: Status, politics and the american temperance movement. Urbana: U of Illinois Press.

Krout, J. (1925). The origins of prohibition. New York: Alfred A. Knopf.

Lucas, S. (1980). Coming to terms with movement studies. Central States Speech Journal, 31, 257-266.

Odegard, P. (1966). Pressure politics: The story of the anti-saloon league. New York: Octagon Books.

Smith, R. (1980). The historical criticism of social movements. Central States Speech Journal, 31, 290-297.

Stewart, C., Smith, C & Denton, R. Persuasion and social movements. Prospect Heights, Il.: Waveland Press, Inc.

Willard, F. (1972). Woman and temperance. New York: Arno Press.